

宋遼金元

The Society of Song, Yuan, and Conquest Dynasty Studies appreciates the generous contributions of Frank Wang and

Laura Young, through the Wang Family Foundation. Through their support the Society has been able to make electronic copy of the initial volumes of the *Sung Studies Newsletter* and the *Journal of Song Yuan Studies* available in the public domain.

Please Note: Because this newsletter was converted to a text-searchable format rather than scanned as a series of graphics images of the pages, it is not identical to the originally published version. The formatting has been corrected to reflect the page breaks in the original newsletter. **As a result, pages may end abruptly in the middle (or even beginning) of a line.** Moreover, the initial scanning converted characters to their simplified form. They have been restored to the traditional form, but some errors may have been introduced in the process.

宋遼金元

Bulletin of
SUNG YUAN
Studies

15

TWO VISITS TO THE PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA

I. A Hundred Days in China: My Research Experience in the P. R. C., 1979

Chu-tsing Li
University of Kansas

As the first senior scholar in the arts and the humanities under the new U.S.-China Scholar Exchange Program, I spent exactly one hundred days traveling all over the country studying paintings and monuments connected with my field of research, the paintings of the Yüan Dynasty. While almost all the other scholars and students under the same program came under the sponsorship of the Ministry of Education, I had the Ministry of Culture as my host. The reason for this difference is that, under the present structure of the Chinese government, almost all the organizations connected with cultural activities, including museums, libraries, and art, music, drama and film groups and colleges, are supervised by that ministry. For my trip, this was a great advantage, for all the facilities under the ministry at all levels, including all the major monuments and museums I requested to visit, were open to me.

Since it will take up too much space to give a detailed narrative account of my trip, I shall only put down below a few of the impressions and observations I gained which may be of interest to you.

1. The largest collection of Chinese painting in general, and of Yüan painting in particular, is in the Palace Museum in Peking. The total number is in the tens of thousands. However, so far only a handful have been shown to the public, and access to the collection is not easy. One reason is that, under the present system, any special viewing of the paintings must be attended by at least three members of the museum staff. Since they receive a tremendous amount of requests for special viewings, the time spent by their staff for this will be enormous. Another reason is that most of the museums do not have special rooms to show paintings. As a result, even in the cases of special guests, they usually limit the amount of works to be viewed to only a few. Thus a scholar who insists on seeing everything connected with his field of interest will be disappointed.

Editor's note: Because of limitations of space, it is not possible to include precise information provided by Professor Li on the museums, monuments and institutions visited and individual artists met.

2. The Palace Museum is not the only one with a large collection of paintings. In terms of the sizes of their painting collections, Shanghai Museum ranks second, with more than 20,000, and both Nanking and Tientsin third, with more than 10,000 each. Liaoning has more than 5,000, with a considerable number of handscrolls from the former palace. Such high numbers are not limited to these major museums. In other museums, they go up to several thousands. When the total is added up from museums in Changchun, Harbin, Taiyuan, Sian, Chengtu, Chungking, Wuhan, Changsha, Canton, Suchou and Yangchou and many others, it will prove an amazing number. For those involved in the research on Ming and Ch'ing painting, this will pose quite a problem.

3. The museum is not the only place with painting collections. In Peking, I found out that the Historical Museum, the Chinese Art Gallery, the Peking Commission of Antiquities, the art gallery of the Central Art College, the Jung-pao-chai, and some individuals, all have collections of their own. For example, in the Central Art College, there are more than 800. In the Lu Shun Art College, there are more than two thousand. In the art colleges in Hang-chou, Nanking and Canton, I found similar situations. There are still many private collections in China. When I visited Professor Jung Keng at his home in Chungshan University in Canton late in September, he told me that he had just turned over about 1,000 paintings to the Canton Municipal Museum, but he still had hundreds in his own hands. Also, at the home of Huang Tu-wei, Associate Chairman of the Kwangtung Artists Association, an old friend of mine, he showed me hundreds of paintings, mostly by Kwangtung artists of Ming and Ch'ing times.

4. New museums are being established in many parts of the country. This is a new development since the Cultural Revolution came to an end a few years ago. For example, in Kiangsu Province, each of the prefectures (each consisting of six to ten districts) has established a museum of its own, usually with materials excavated or collected locally as their main collections. In Shanghai, a special city that ranks with the provinces administratively, several of the ten districts under it are establishing museums of their own, with

Chia-ting already well established. In Chekiang Province, the situation is also similar. In that kind of context, the number of museums and the amount of materials for future research will be extremely large.

5. In spite of all these developments, access to these museums and collections is not easy. In fact, the situation has been tightened during the recent months. Since early this year, photographing in museums is forbidden, especially of unpublished materials. Some museums tried to charge very high fees for photographing. For example, at the Yung-lo-kung in Jui-ch'eng, they wanted RMB \$100 for a single shot. On the other hand, there are some exceptions. In the Shanghai Museum, in the exhibition of Ming and Ch'ing paintings, they indicated on the label whether or not it was all right to photograph a particular painting. In the Nanking Museum, they allowed people to photograph objects in their exhibition of Cultural Relics from Kiangsu. However, with materials for special viewings, it is no longer possible to photograph, though I did get some photographs of the Yüan paintings in a number of museums. The fees they charge for photographs also vary, but I paid on the average about RMB7 per photographs.

6. In order to have more access to the collections, one has to have some official status. With the sponsorship of either the Ministry of Culture or the National Bureau of Antiquities, one can get to see a certain amount of the materials. Also, the best time to be in China is in the fall, around October 1, when they celebrate the founding of the PRC. Every year during this period, museums will put up special exhibitions, usually paintings. As a rule, early paintings (Sung and Yüan or before) are not shown during the rest of the year.

7. In spite of all the exciting developments in art and archaeology, art history is not a well-developed field in China. In all of China, there is only one department of art history, which is in the Central Art College in Peking. Under the present educational system, all the colleges of fine arts (including art, music, drama, film and others) are separate from the universities and come under the supervision of the Ministry of Culture. As a result, art history is almost not taught in the universities. If it is, it comes under the program of archaeology in the departments of history. There are a number of such archaeology programs in the country, such as Peking, Nanking, Chungshan (Canton), Sian, Shenyang and some other universities. Among them, Peking University's program, headed by Professor Shu Pai 宿白, seems to be the best. It has trained most of the people who are on the staff of the major museums. Similarly, graduates of the Central Art College's art history department are

now all over the country, either teaching art history in art colleges or serving as curators in museums. Both the Central Art College's art history and Peking University's archaeology programs have had foreign students. PerOlov Leijon of Stockholm's Museum of Far Eastern Antiquities was a graduate of the Central Art College before the Cultural Revolution.

8. Publications of art materials are coming out fast, but still have not been as fast as they want them to be. Two things are holding them up. One is the shortage of printing facilities. Many books and journals are lining up in the printing services and can only be scheduled for publication in 1980 and 1981. Because of the slow pace, the Wen Wu Press has taken some materials (for example, a volume on Tunhuang painting) to Hong Kong to be printed. A number of scholars have sent their articles for publication in Hong Kong journals, such as the Artist 藝術家. Another reason is the shortage of paper. With the whole country now eagerly absorbing all kinds of books and journals the supply of books and journals cannot keep up with the demand. From my experience, in Peking, I found that sometimes a new book was sold out within a week. The Mei-shu yen-chiu, published by the Central Art College, received an allocation of paper to print 80,000 copies. Shortly after it came out, the copies were all gone. Such consumption is almost unheard of abroad for art journals. Fortunately, since they have special allocation for distribution abroad, it is sometimes more available outside than inside the country. Now all the art colleges have been preparing to publish their own journals. Some, like the ones in Nanking and Shantung, have appeared. Many museums are also planning to put out their own journals. A number of major museums in cooperation with the Wen Wu Press have already prepared new volumes on their painting collections, each including about 150 to 200 paintings. The first volume of the series on the Palace Museum collection is already out. Volumes from the Tientsin, Liaoning, Shanghai, Hangchou, Nanking and other museums are scheduled to come out in 1980. In paintings, at least two books are eagerly awaited by people in the field. One is a collection of articles by Hsieh Chih-liu of Shanghai and the other by Hsu Pang-ta, both of whom are the most knowledgeable people in the field since they have been sent by the government around the country to authenticate paintings in museums. Tientsin Museum will have a volume out on Chinese painting soon, and Wang Po-min of Hangchou has another on the same subject and Shih Yen of the same college will have one on Chinese sculpture.

9. Although I was not able to visit many libraries, I feel that the library of the Central Art College probably has the best collection of art books in

China. The collection was built up during the 1950's when a large number of old books were available in Liu-li-ch'ang in Peking. For many of the old books not available outside of China, they probably have them. However, it almost stopped buying new materials (especially those from abroad) after 1966. Though resumed in the last several years, they have a long way to go to catch up. Archaeological books are probably most complete in three libraries, namely, the Peking Library, that of the Institute of Archaeology and that of Peking University. Unfortunately xerox facilities are extremely rare in China. I heard that there is only one at the Peking Library. The Central Art College is supposed to get one soon.

10. During all my travels, I found that art historians and curators were most eager to receive publications from abroad. Any reprints to them will be greatly welcome. The only drawback is that they prefer to have them in Chinese rather than in English. They are also eager to have exchanges of publications.

11. My most interesting and rewarding experience during the whole trip was Tunhuang. With both Ch'ang Shu-hung, Director of the Tunhuang Research Institute, and Chin Wei-no, a specialist in Buddhist art and Tunhuang, traveling with me from Lanchou to Tunhuang, I had plenty of help in organizing the eight days I spent there. With that amount of time I was able to go over more than 300 of the caves, more or less chronologically. I was able to gain a good picture of the development of Chinese painting from Northern Wei to Yüan. One secret is that, in studying the caves by combining the approaches to architectural structures, sculpture and painting, one can gain a more complete understanding of the art of Tunhuang. So far, most of the books cover only the selected pieces, seldom giving a complete picture of individual caves. I was told that during the early 1960's there was a plan to publish complete studies of individual caves. Several such studies were actually completed, but the Cultural Revolution prevented their publication. Now the Wen Wu Press is preparing some volumes on individual caves. They were photographing them systematically when I was there. Hopefully they will come out in the near future.

The excitement we experienced while at Tunhuang was the big flood that brought three feet of water to the town of Tunhuang, still an important communication center between Kansu, Sinkiang, Chinghai and Tibet. Since all the buildings were constructed on mud walls, including the hotel for visitors, they all collapsed. Fortunately we were staying in the guesthouse of the Institute, right by the caves, which were still 10 miles or more away from the

town. We were not affected, though we did have some problems in leaving. Eventually we had to make a detour on a truck to go by way of An-hsi in the dead of night, driving over the vast desert with nothing to guide us but the stars, in order to get to Liu-yüan to catch the train. However, that experience was much better than that of some foreign tourists who, after taking that 24-hour train from Lanchou, were told at Liu-yüan that they had to turn back without seeing Tunhuang.

12. As a whole this trip not only gave me the opportunity to give access to a great number of Yüan paintings (including many never published before) but also was the most meaningful trip in my life. Through it I was able to gain an overview of art and art history in China during the last thirty years, including their achievements, their developments, their problems and their ordeals during the Cultural Revolution. With many of the 55 curators and art historians and 45 artists I have met, I had long conversations, some very frank and candid, concerning their experiences and aspirations. In addition, I was able to meet many of my old friends, including high school classmates, college friends, and those who studied with me in the U.S. during the late 1940's and early 1950's, most of whom I have not seen since 1947 when I first came to America. Through future meetings and publications, I hope that I shall be able to share with you some of these impressions.

II. Yüan Studies in the People's Republic of China

John D. Langlois, Jr.

As a member of the Ming Qing History Delegation to the PRC, sponsored by the National Academy of Sciences, I visited Beijing and other cities to meet with Chinese historians. I took advantage of the opportunity to inquire about the state of Yuan studies in each of the cities we visited.

In Beijing the most active scholar appears to be Chen Gaohua 陳高華, whose earliest article on Yuan subjects was published in 1964. His most recent essay appears in the inaugural issue of Zhongguoshi yanjiu 中國史研究 (1: 1979), and is entitled "Yuandai hudengzhi luelun 元代戶等制略論" (pp. 127-134). It analyzes the gradations of household registrations, based on household wealth, that were applied by the Mongols to ensure the collection of tax revenue. Chen discusses the shuweibu 鼠尾簿 or "rat-tail registers" in particular.

The same periodical contains an article by the Nanjing University scholar Han Rulin 韓儒林, entitled "Yuandai di Jilijisi ji qi lizhin zhu bu 元代的吉利吉思及其鄰近諸部" (pp. 108-126). This article discusses the Khirghiz and their neighboring tribes in Yuan times.

In Nanjing University Yuan studies are especially lively. At the Department of History several scholars have formed the Yuanshizu 元史組 ("Yuan History Group"), under the supervision of Han Rulin. Professor Han was not in Nanjing during our visit, but his student Qiu Shusen 邱樹森 guided me through their study and library. The Study Group publishes a serial entitled Yuanshi ji beifang minzu shi yanhiu jikan 元史及北方民族史研究集刊. To date three numbers have been published, but the periodical is intended "for internal circulation" (neibu jiaoliu 內部交流). This serial, aside from containing preliminary versions of articles on various aspects of Yüan history and the history of the northern minorities, also contains draft chapters of a new history of the Yüan. These chapters are appearing under the title Yuanshi gangyao 元史綱要. The chapters are unsigned, but Qiu Shusen seems to be one of the primary authors. The contents of the three chapters issued to date (July 1977, March 1978, and December 1978) are as follows:

1. Mongol tribes during the period of Liao and Jin Rule
 - A. Liao and Jin rule over the Mongol tribes
 - B. Social conditions among the Mongol tribes
2. The great peasant uprisings at the end of the Yuan
 - A. The sudden eruption of peasant uprisings at the end of the Yuan, and their temporary frustration
 - B. Development and defeat of the late Yuan peasant uprisings
 - C. Zhu Yuanzhang's paxification of the isolated powers in the south and the victory of the northern expedition
3. Yuan dynasty relations with the Qinchanguo 欽察汗國 and the Yili hanguo 伊利汗國

Other articles in the serial deal with postal routes in Lingbei xingsheng 嶺北行省, the late Yüan Red Turban rebel Peng Yingyu 彭瑩玉, the Zhaotaosi 招討司 in Xibeilu 西北路 under the Liao, the Khirghiz under the Yüan, the city walls of Karakorum, the philosopher Deng Mu 鄧牧 and his Boya qin 伯牙琴 the lijia 裏甲 system in Yüan times, the Red Turban general Mao Gui 毛貴.

In assessing the Yuan period, scholars in the PRC start with the assumption that China is a multi-ethnic state. They further assume that all the national minorities share with the Han majority the desire for national unity. Under these assumptions, the Yuan and the Qing are not viewed as foreign conquest dynasties. Rather, they are seen as Chinese dynasties in which non-Han peoples, but Chinese peoples nonetheless, achieved domination and national unity.

In appraising Khubilai Khagan, these scholars point out that while he unified China and therefore deserves high praise, he also became the representative and agent of Han-Chinese landlord interests and of Mongol slave-owner interests. In order to promote these interests, Khubilai adopted the techniques of class and ethnic repression. Beyond these, he also employed racist, Buddhist and Confucian thought and religion to dupe and paralyze (qipian 欺騙, mabi 麻痹) the people. Ultimately these methods provoked massive resistance in the form of people's uprisings.

The operating principle of the historical writing in the documents observed is that the "ruling nationality" (tongzhi minzu 統制民族) at times was the Han people and at other times Mongols or Manchus. The Han people, they note, have no birth-right to rule China. Therefore, expressions like yizu ru qin 異族入侵 ("an alien nationality invaded [China]") are unacceptable.

Peasant wars at the end of the Yüan, the documents point out, must not be construed as struggles between nationalities (minzu douzheng 民族鬥爭). This is because the Yüan rule was actually "a joint dictatorship" (lianhe zhuanzheng 聯合專政), on the part of Mongol and Han (as well as other) aristocrats, over the laboring people of various nationalities. The struggles at the end of the Yüan were therefore primarily class struggles, not racial or ethnic.